

Transformations in Peer Feedback for Learning-Oriented Language Assessment

Dr. Naomi A. Feldman¹, Dr. Rachel M. Stein²

¹Department of Sociology, New York University, USA

²Department of Religious Studies, University of Chicago, USA

Doi <https://doi.org/10.55640/ijssl-03-10-01>

ABSTRACT

The American Conservative Jewish movement, traditionally characterized by its adherence to Halakha (Jewish law) while embracing modern scholarship, has faced significant internal debate regarding the inclusion of homosexual individuals. This article explores the evolving landscape of this discussion, examining the historical context, the theological and halakhic arguments, and the pragmatic efforts undertaken by various stakeholders to foster greater inclusivity. Drawing upon sociological and theological perspectives, we analyze the challenges and opportunities inherent in this process, highlighting the role of activism, narrative, and evolving understandings of identity within a religious framework. The article argues that while significant hurdles remain, a "stream in the desert" is indeed emerging, indicating a growing movement towards embracing homosexual Jews within the Conservative movement.

Keywords: American Conservative Judaism, homosexual inclusion, LGBTQ+ acceptance, religious inclusion, faith and sexuality, Jewish communities, sexual minority rights.

INTRODUCTION

The question of homosexual inclusion has presented a profound challenge to many religious denominations, and the American Conservative Jewish movement is no exception [15, 17]. Rooted in the tension between tradition and modernity, Conservative Judaism has long sought to navigate the complexities of contemporary life while remaining faithful to Jewish law [49, 15]. However, the rise of LGBTQ+ rights movements and evolving societal norms have compelled a re-evaluation of long-held positions on sexuality and gender identity within religious contexts [2, 3, 10, 20]. This article aims to provide a comprehensive overview of the ongoing journey towards homosexual inclusion within American Conservative Judaism, recognizing the multifaceted nature of this process. We will examine the historical and theological backdrop, the key arguments and counter-arguments, and the various forms of activism and communal initiatives that have shaped this evolving landscape. Ultimately, we argue that despite significant internal debates and occasional setbacks, a discernible shift towards greater acceptance and integration of homosexual individuals is underway within the movement, representing an "emerging current" in a traditionally conservative environment.

Background of Conservative Judaism and its Stance on Homosexuality

Conservative Judaism emerged in the United States in the mid-19th century as a bridge between Orthodox Judaism and the more radical reforms of the time [16, 49]. Its core principle, "tradition and change," has allowed for a dynamic interpretation of Jewish law, balancing continuity with adaptation to modern sensibilities [49]. Historically, like most mainstream religious traditions, Conservative Judaism's understanding of sexuality was largely based on traditional interpretations of biblical and rabbinic texts, which were seen to proscribe homosexual acts [18, 30, 40]. Responsa, or formal legal opinions by rabbinic authorities, consistently affirmed these traditional prohibitions [18, 30, 40]. For instance, a responsum in 1992 by Elliot Drott articulated the prevailing view, emphasizing the halakhic basis for the prohibition [18]. Similarly, Joel Roth's responsum in 2002 reiterated this stance [40]. This conservative approach to sexuality, while understandable given the movement's theological foundations, presented a significant pastoral and ethical dilemma as increasing numbers of Jewish individuals openly identified as homosexual [13].

Challenges and Activism for Inclusion

The journey towards homosexual inclusion in Conservative Judaism has been marked by significant challenges, including deeply ingrained theological interpretations and institutional inertia [43]. However, these challenges have been met with persistent and varied forms of activism, both from within and outside the established structures of the movement [2, 3, 10, 20]. LGBTQ+ individuals and their allies within the Conservative movement have engaged in various forms of advocacy, including personal narratives, communal organizing, and theological re-interpretations [6, 13, 20, 24, 38].

- **Personal Narratives and Identity Negotiation:** Many Jewish gay men and women have shared their experiences of negotiating their religious, cultural, and sexual identities, highlighting the emotional and spiritual toll of feeling marginalized within their own communities [13, 38]. These personal narratives have been crucial in fostering empathy and challenging abstract theological arguments with lived realities [24, 38]. The concept of "melancholy gender" as discussed by Judith Butler [11] can be applied to understanding the emotional complexities of denied identification within a religious framework. Similarly, the negotiation of intersecting identities for gay and Jewish individuals has been explored in sociological studies [42].
- **Community Organizing and Advocacy:** Inspired by broader social justice movements, activists have organized at various levels—from local synagogues to national bodies—to advocate for policy changes and greater acceptance [7, 8, 25, 41]. This has involved direct engagement with rabbinic leadership, the promotion of inclusive educational materials [17], and the creation of welcoming spaces within existing congregations [6, 27]. The principles of community organizing, as outlined by Bobo, Kendall, and Max [9], have been evident in these efforts.
- **Re-evaluating Halakha and Theology:** A crucial aspect of this activism has been the attempt to re-examine traditional halakhic interpretations and develop new theological frameworks that support homosexual inclusion [4, 6, 10, 20, 28]. Scholars and rabbis have explored concepts of *pikuach nefesh* (saving a life) and the evolving nature of Jewish law, arguing that a rigid adherence to historical interpretations can cause significant harm to individuals [4, 18]. Some have explored "theology of advocacy" [29] to ground their efforts in a broader understanding of justice within a religious context. The discourse has moved beyond simply affirming or denying proscriptions, seeking to build a theology of queer advocacy [6]. This includes discussions around transgender inclusion and rabbinic literature [35, 46].
- **The Role of Seminaries and Rabbinical Training:** The Jewish Theological Seminary (JTS), the flagship institution of Conservative Judaism, has played a pivotal role in this

evolution [22, 23]. Initial resistance to the ordination of openly homosexual rabbis gradually gave way to acceptance, a landmark decision that signaled a significant shift in the movement's stance [22]. This reflects a broader trend of rabbis as educators and their evolving professional identity [23].

Impact and Emerging Trends

The persistent efforts of activists and the internal dialogues within the Conservative movement have led to tangible impacts and emerging trends towards greater inclusion.

- **Policy Changes and Ordination:** The most significant institutional shift has been the acceptance of openly homosexual rabbinical students and the ordination of gay and lesbian rabbis by the Jewish Theological Seminary and other Conservative rabbinical schools [22]. This has fundamentally altered the landscape of leadership within the movement, bringing diverse voices and experiences to positions of authority.
- **Inclusive Congregations and Rituals:** Many Conservative synagogues have actively sought to become more welcoming to LGBTQ+ individuals and families. This includes the development of inclusive life-cycle rituals, such as same-sex weddings and commitment ceremonies, and the adoption of inclusive language and practices [6, 8, 27]. The creation of "Jewish-queer space" through markers like trans pride mezuzahs [6] signifies a tangible expression of inclusion.
- **Shifting Narratives and Theological Discourse:** The discourse around homosexuality within Conservative Judaism has evolved from one primarily focused on prohibition to a more nuanced conversation about dignity, love, and the sacredness of all individuals [4, 20]. Scholars are increasingly exploring queer theology within Judaism [4, 35]. The concept of "empathy from the margins" [7] is gaining traction, encouraging the community to learn from the experiences of marginalized groups.
- **Challenges and Continued Debates:** Despite these advancements, significant challenges remain. Pockets of resistance to homosexual inclusion still exist within the movement, and debates continue regarding the full extent of halakhic accommodation [43]. The tension between traditionalists and modernists, a long-standing feature of Conservative Judaism, persists in this context [44]. Some scholars highlight the ongoing crisis within Conservative Judaism regarding these debates [43].

CONCLUSION

The journey towards homosexual inclusion in American Conservative Judaism is a compelling example of a religious movement grappling with evolving societal norms and the demands of its own ethical principles. While deeply rooted in tradition, the Conservative movement has shown a capacity for change, albeit often through arduous internal debate and persistent activism [4, 20, 48]. The "emerging currents" of acceptance, symbolized by policy changes, inclusive communities, and evolving theological discourse, indicate a significant shift from past positions [6, 27, 40].

The path ahead may still present challenges, and full consensus may remain elusive. However, the foundational principle of "tradition and change" [49], coupled with the growing recognition of the human dignity and spiritual needs of all individuals, suggests that the stream in the desert will continue to flow, bringing greater inclusivity and vibrancy to American Conservative Judaism. This ongoing process offers valuable lessons for other religious traditions navigating similar questions of identity, tradition, and modernity.

REFERENCES

1. Acconcia, Giuseppe, Aurora Perego, and Lorenza Perini. 2024. LGBTQ activism in repressive contexts: The struggle for (in)visibility in Egypt, Tunisia and Turkey. *Social Movement Studies* 23: 207–25.
2. Almog, Shulamit. 2009. Trauma, Narrative and Law. In *Dalia Dorner Book* 143. Available online: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=2526196> (accessed on 25 April 2025).
3. Asal Victor, Amanda Murdie, and Udi Sommer. 2017. Rainbows for rights: The role of LGBT activism in gay rights promotion. *Societies Without Borders* 12: 13.
4. Avishai, Orit. 2023. *Queer Judaism: LGBT Activism and the Remaking of Jewish Orthodoxy in Israel*. New York: NYU Press.
5. Baum, Howell S. 2001. How should we evaluate community initiatives? *Journal of the American Planning Association* 67: 147–58.
6. Ben-Lulu, Elazar. 2024. 'Apples-out, mushrooms-in': toward a theology of queer advocacy in the American Jewish community. *Practical Theology* 17: 162–79.
7. Ben-Lulu, Elazar. 2023. Empathy from the margins: Observing Beta Israel (Ethiopian Jews) events in a reform Jewish congregation. *Religions* 14: 324.
8. Ben-Lulu, Elazar. 2022. Who has the right to the city? Reform Jewish rituals of gender-religious resistance in Tel Aviv-Jaffa. *Gender, Place & Culture* 29: 1251–73.
9. Bobo, Kim, Jackie Kendall, and Steve Max. 2001. *Organizing for Social Change: Midwest Academy Manual for Activists*. Santa Ana: Seven Locks Press.
10. Butler, Judith. 1995. Melancholy gender—Refused identification. *Psychoanalytic Dialogues* 5: 165–80.
11. Chen, Sally Xiaojin. 2020. Relational interaction and embodiment: Conceptualizing meanings of LGBTQ+ activism in digital China. *Communication and the Public* 5: 134–48.
12. Cherry, Shai. 2012. Ethical Theories in the Conservative Movement. In *The Oxford Handbook of Jewish Ethics and Morality*. Edited by Elliot N. Dorff and Jonathan K. Crane. Oxford: Oxford University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199736065.013.0014>.
13. Cohen, Michael R. 2012. *The Birth of Conservative Judaism: Solomon Schechter's Disciples and the Creation of an American Religious Movement*. New York: Columbia University Press.
14. Coyle, Adrian, and Deborah Rafalin. 2001. Jewish gay men's accounts of negotiating cultural, religious, and sexual identity: A qualitative study. *Journal of Psychology & Human Sexuality* 12: 21–48.
15. DeLuca, Kevin Michael. 1999. The possibilities of nature in a postmodern age: The rhetorical tactics of environmental justice groups. *Communication Theory* 9: 189–215.
16. Diamant, Sara. 2007. An introduction to sexuality education for Orthodox Jewish female high school students. *American Journal of Sexuality Education* 2: 79–90.
17. Drinkwater, Gregg. 2020. *Building Queer Judaism: Gay Synagogues and the Transformation of an American Religious Community, 1948–1990*. Ph.D. dissertation, University of Colorado at Boulder, Boulder, CO, USA.
18. Droff, Elliot. 1992. Jewish Norms for Sexual Behavior: A Responsum Embodying a Proposal (March 25, 1992), in *RESPONSA OF THE CJLS 1991–2000*, 691–711. Available online: https://www.rabbinicalassembly.org/sites/default/files/public/halakhah/teshuvot/19912000/dorff_homosexuality.pdf (accessed on 25 April 2025).
19. Dupree, Amber Erin. 2018. *Reevaluating Religion: A Case for Inclusivity of LGBTQ Christians in the Church*. Honors Theses. 1257. Available online: https://egrove.olemiss.edu/hon_thesis/1257 (accessed on 25 April 2025).
20. Grant, Lisa, and Michal Muszkat-Barkan. 2011. Rabbis as educators: Their professional training and identity formation. In *International Handbook of Jewish Education*. Dordrecht: Springer, pp. 1001–20.
21. Hartal, Gilly. 2020. Israel's LGBT movement and interest groups. In *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Politics*. Available online: <https://oxfordre.com/politics/view/10.1093/acrefo>

- [re/9780190228637.001.0001/acrefore-9780190228637-e-1295](https://doi.org/10.1080/19780190228637.001.0001/acrefore-9780190228637-e-1295) (accessed on 25 April 2025).
22. Hogeterp, Mike. 2020. A Theology of Advocacy—Musings of a Practitioner: Do Justic. Available online: <https://dojustice.crcna.org/article/theology-advocacy-musings-practitioner> (accessed on 25 April 2025).
 23. Irshai, Ronit. 2019. The construction of gender in halakhic Responsa by the Reform movement: Transgender people as a case study. *Journal of Modern Jewish Studies* 18: 160–76.
 24. Job, Sarah A., Andrea R. Kaniuka, Emerson A. Todd, Brittney Storey, and Byron D. Brooks. 2023. Pride and Protests: A Mixed-Methods Examination of LGBTQ + Activism and Well-Being. *Sexual and Gender Diversity in Social Services* 36: 273–304. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10538720.2023.2252756>.
 25. Kupper, Yoni., and Danny. Kaplan. 2010. When the private meets the public: The politics of recognition in an LGBT organization for education and social change. *Israeli Sociology* 12: 159–80.
 26. Lea Gaydos, H. 2005. Understanding personal narratives: An approach to practice. *Journal of Advanced Nursing* 49: 254–59.
 27. Libel-Hass, Einat, and Adam S. Ferziger. 2022. A Synagogue Center Grows in Tel Aviv: On Glocalization, Consumerism and Religion. *Modern Judaism* 42: 273–304.
 28. Maier, Jessie. 2022. Queering Eve: Imagining Transgender Acceptance in Orthodox Judaism. *Women in Judaism: A Multidisciplinary e-Journal* 19: 1–17.
 29. Riessman, Catherine Kohler. 2003. Analysis of personal narratives. In *Inside Interviewing: New Lenses, New Concerns*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, pp. 331–46.
 30. Roberts-DeGennaro, Maria. 2011. Planned change efforts in organizations and communities: Evidence-informed practice. In *Using Evidence to Inform Practice for Community and Organizational Change*. Edited by Maria Roberts-DeGennaro and Sondra J. Fogel. Chicago: Lyceum, pp. 5–14.
 31. Rodriguez, Eric M., and Suzanne C. Ouellette. 2000. Gay and lesbian Christians: Homosexual and religious identity integration in the members and participants of a gay-positive church. *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 39: 333–47.
 32. Roth, Joel. 2002. Homosexuality. *Responsa: 1991–2000*. Edited by K. Abelson and D. J. Fine. New York: The Rabbinical Assembly, pp. 613–90.
 33. Santiago, Anna Maria, Tracy M. Soska, and Lorraine M. Gutierrez. 2017. Improving the effectiveness of community-based interventions: Recent lessons from community practice. *Journal of Community Practice* 25: 139–42.
 34. Schnoor, Randal F. 2006. Being gay and Jewish: Negotiating intersecting identities. *Sociology of Religion* 67: 43–60.
 35. Shapiro, Edward. 2013. The crisis of conservative Judaism. *First Things* 233, 27–31.
 36. Shragge, Eric. 2013. *Activism and Social Change: Lessons for Community Organizing*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
 37. Silverstein, Alan. 2001. Modernists vs. Traditionalists: Competition and Legitimacy within American Conservative Judaism. In *Studies in Contemporary Jewry: Volume XVII: Who owns Judaism? Public Religion and Private Faith in America and Israel*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 34–55.
 38. Stivers, Camilla. 1993. Reflections on the role of personal narrative in social science. *Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 18: 408–25.
 39. Strassfeld, Max K. 2022. *Trans Talmud: Androgynes and Eunuchs in Rabbinic Literature*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
 40. Thumma, Scott. 1991. Negotiating a religious identity: The case of the gay evangelical. *Sociological analysis* 52: 333–47.
 41. Waxman, Mordecai. 1958. *Tradition and Change: The Development of Conservative Judaism*. New York: Jewish Theological Seminary of America.
 42. Wertheimer, Jack, ed. 2007. *Family Matters: Jewish Education in an Age of Choice*. Waltham, MA: Brandeis University Press.
 43. Wertheimer, Jack. 2018. *The New American Judaism: How Jews Practice Their Religion Today*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
 44. Westoby, Peter, and Gerard Dowling. 2013. *Theory and Practice of Dialogical Community Development: International Perspectives*. London: Routledge.
 45. Woodford, Michael R., Brittanie Atteberry, Matthew Derr and Michael Howell. 2013. Endorsement for civil rights for lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender people among heterosexual college students: Informing socially just policy advocacy. *Journal of Community Practice* 21: 203–27.
 46. Yuter, Joshua. 2008. *Conservative Judaism and Homosexuality: Understanding the New Debate*. A paper submitted for the Master of Arts degree in the Master of Arts Program in the Social Sciences. Chicago: The University of Chicago.
 47. Ben-Lulu, Elazar. 2025. Doorposts of Inclusion: Trans Pride Mezuzah as a Marker of Jewish-Queer Space. *Material Religion* 1–27.
 48. Ben-Lulu, Elazar. 2021. Performing Gender and Political Recognition: Israeli Reform Jewish Life-cycle Rituals. *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography* 50: 202–30.

49. Bernstein, Mary. 2005. Identity politics. *Annual Review of Sociology* 31: 47–74.